AMERICAN JOURNAL OF
ARTS AND HUMAN SCIENCE (AJAHS)
ISSN: 2832-451X (ONLINE)
VOLUME 3 ISSUE 4 (2024)

PUBLISHED BY
E-PALLI PUBLISHERS, DELAWARE, USA

American Journal of
Arts and Human Science (AJAHS)

Volume 3 Issue 4, Year 2024
ISSN: 2832-451X (Online)
DOI: https://doi.org/10.54536/ajahs.v3i4.3638
https://journals.e-palli.com/home/index.php/ajahs

Comparative Analysis of Flipped Classroom Implementation in Western and Indian Indoctrination

Suvendu Ray[1*], Deb Prasad Sikdar[1]

Article Information

Received: August 03, 2024
Accepted: September 18, 2024
Published: October 31, 2024

Keywords

Comparative Study, Flipped Classroom, Indian Indoctrination, Western Countries

ABSTRACT

The flipped classroom, a popular teaching method in Western countries, has gained popularity due to its ability to address traditional teaching limitations. However, India's diverse education system presents unique challenges, including technological disparities, traditional practices, and curriculum rigidity. This study aimed to compare the implementation and outcomes of the flipped classroom model in Western countries and India, revealing key factors contributing to its success or challenges. The study aimed to provide insights into how the flipped classroom model can be adapted and optimized to fit different educational environments, ultimately improving learning outcomes and teaching practices globally. The study has explored adopting and implementing the flipped classroom model in Western countries and India, identifying challenges and barriers. It has also evaluated educational outcomes, explored the role of technological infrastructure, assesses teacher readiness and training, and provides explored the role of technological infrastructure, assessed teacher readiness and training, and explored the role of technological infrastructure, assessed teacher readiness and training, and provided recommendations for enhancing its effectiveness in India. The flipped classroom model can enhance educational outcomes by increasing engagement and active learning. However, India faces unique challenges and needs targeted solutions. India should invest in technology, professional development, curriculum adaptation, and community engagement to maximize its benefits.

INTRODUCTION

The flipped classroom model is a significant innovation in educational methodologies, combining traditional teaching methods with online learning. Students engage with instructional content at home, often through videos or online materials, while classroom time is dedicated to interactive activities (Bergman & Sams, 2012). This dynamic, student-centered approach promotes active engagement, deeper understanding, and enhanced knowledge application. It was found that flipped classroom approach is more effective than traditional teaching (Boyraz & Ocak, 2017; Cetin Koroglu & Cakir, 2017; Ekmekci, 2017; Huang & Hong, 2016; Yu & Wang, 2016; Keskin, 2023). The flipped classroom, initially popularized in Western education, has gained popularity in various settings due to its potential to address limitations of traditional teaching methods (Çakır *et al.*, 2021). In Western countries, the model has shown promising outcomes in student engagement, academic performance, and overall learning experience due to advanced technological infrastructure, flexible curricula, and a culture that encourages educational innovation. However, India's diverse and complex education system presents unique challenges, such as technological disparities, traditional practices, and curriculum rigidity, which significantly impact the effectiveness and feasibility of the flipped classroom approach in India (Srinivasan & Kumar, 2020).

The traditional classroom model, which relies on lectures and passive listening, has been criticized for its limitations in promoting deep understanding and critical thinking, but the flipped classroom model addresses these issues through interactive activities (Nouri, 2016; Dong *et al.*, 2021; Youhasan *et al.*, 2022). This approach creates a more engaging learning environment where students can actively apply concepts, collaborate with peers, and receive immediate feedback from instructors (Lewis *et al.*, 2018; Saira *et al.*, 2021). In Western countries, the flipped classroom model has been supported by widespread access to digital technology, a culture of educational experimentation, and policies encouraging pedagogical innovation. However, the adoption of the flipped classroom model in India is influenced by various contextual factors, including the digital divide between urban and rural areas, traditional teaching practices, and a rigid curriculum. Understanding these challenges is crucial for identifying strategies to enhance the model's effectiveness and ensure its equitable application across different educational settings.

The study has compared the implementation and outcomes of the flipped classroom model in Western countries and India, providing insights into its adaptation to diverse educational contexts. The findings can help develop strategies to overcome barriers, optimize the model's effectiveness, and ensure equitable application. The study has contributed to the discourse on educational innovation and technology integration, offering evidence-based recommendations for improving teaching and learning practices. Understanding factors influencing the success of the flipped classroom model can guide future

[1] Department of Education, University of Kalyani, Pin-741 235, West Bengal, India
[*] Corresponding author's email: suvenduray1998@gmail.com

research and practice, ultimately enhancing educational quality and student outcomes worldwide.

So, the researcher aimed to conduct a comparative analysis (Tsvetkov, 2014; Bolbakov *et al.*, 2020) of the flipped classroom model's implementation and impact in Western countries versus India. By examining the experiences of both contexts, this research seeks to uncover the key factors that contribute to the success or challenges of this pedagogical approach. The findings of this study are intended to provide insights into how the flipped classroom model can be adapted and optimized to fit different educational environments, ultimately contributing to improved learning outcomes and teaching practices globally.

Objectives of the Study

This study will examine the adoption and implementation of the flipped classroom model in Western countries and India, identifying key challenges and barriers. It will evaluate the educational outcomes, explores the role of technological infrastructure in its success, assesses teacher readiness and training, and provides recommendations for enhancing its effectiveness in India. The study also will examine the readiness and training of teachers in implementing the flipped classroom approach in Western countries and India.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The study is set up to use a combination of literature review, comparative analysis, and empirical investigation as a pattern with a qualitative approach in nature to address the objectives mentioned above. Comparative analysis aims to identify similarities and variances in conditions or outcomes among large-scale social units, such as regions, nations, societies, and cultures (Drobnič, 2014). A comparative analysis allows associating new knowledge with the view of the world (Tsvetkov, 2014; Bolbakov *et al.*, 2020). A qualitative comparative analysis has been conducted in the study (Ragin, 1984; Baptist & Befani, 2015; Schatz & Welle, 2016). A thorough analysis of the body of research on the flipped classroom model's application in Western nations and India is compared in the following sections, with an emphasis on important discoveries about adoption, obstacles, educational outcomes, and technology infrastructure.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Adoption and Implementation of the Flipped Classroom Model in Western Countries and India

Higher Adoption in Western Countries

The flipped classroom model is widely adopted in Western countries, especially in higher education and K-12 settings (Habib & Morse, 2022), due to the availability of advanced technological infrastructure and widespread internet access, enabling its seamless implementation in these regions. Previous publications have published works on designing and implementing a flipped classroom model in K-12 education (Uzunboylu & Karagozlu, 2015; Zainuddin & Halili, 2016; Papadakis, 2019; Li *et al.*, 2024). American colleges and universities pioneered the flipped learning model, which has since been adopted in the UK and Ukraine, significantly impacting higher education worldwide (Martynyuk, 2019).

Varied Adoption in India

The flipped classroom model in India is gaining popularity in urban areas and private institutions, but less in rural areas and government schools. Adoption is higher in STEM subjects, where it encourages practical, hands-on learning during class time.The rise of web 2.0 tools and internet service penetration has led to a surge in web resources created by Indian contributors, enabling the implementation of dynamic and relevant teaching methods like the Flipped Classroom Model (Srinivasan & Kumar, 2020).

Role of Educational Policy and Curriculum

Western educational systems offer flexible curricula, allowing for innovative teaching methods like flipped classrooms. However, India's rigid curriculum and standardized testing hinder widespread adoption of flipped classrooms, limiting their implementation to supplementary or experimental use.

Teacher Training and Professional Development

Technology optimizes class time and promotes student-led learning, leading secondary and higher education institutions to adopt the FL model, typically implemented by experienced educators (Plešec Gasparič *et al.*, 2020; Wang & Zhu, 2019; Lai & Hwang, 2016). Western countries prioritize teacher training and professional development, enabling the successful implementation of the flipped classroom model. However, in India, the absence of systematic training in innovative teaching methods hinders its widespread adoption. Despite this, efforts are being made to incorporate digital literacy and modern pedagogies.

Student Engagement and Participation

The flipped model allows students to collaborate with teachers and peers, making class time more enjoyable, productive, and interesting (González-Zamar & Abad-Segura, 2022). It allows students to absorb content, watch lectures, and access readings through a learning management system (Brewer & Movahedazarhouligh, 2018; Kong & Song, 2015). So, it has been successful in Western countries, boosting student engagement and active participation. However, in India, where traditional teaching methods are prevalent, student engagement varies. Student engagement is a complex construct that is related to several factors that includes emotions, behavior, culture and cognition (Kahu, 2013; Srinivasan & Kumar, 2020). Effective implementation leads to improved understanding and retention of material, but less consistent success in areas with limited resources.

Challenges and Barriers in the Adoption of the Flipped Classroom Model in India Compared to Western Countries

Table 1: Present the challenges in adoption of the Flipped Classroom Model in India Compared to Western Countries

Sl. No.	Key Point	Western Countries	India
1	Technological Infrastructure	The flipped classroom model is well-supported by high-speed internet, widespread computer and tablet access, and established digital learning platforms, making it accessible to most students and teachers in Western countries.	India faces a significant challenge due to the digital divide, particularly in rural areas, where students often lack reliable internet access or necessary devices for watching lecture videos at home, hindering the feasibility of the flipped classroom model.
2	Cultural and Educational Norms	Western countries' educational culture prioritizes critical thinking, self-directed learning, and active classroom engagement, promoting a flipped classroom approach and fostering openness to pedagogical innovations.	The Indian education system's traditional teaching methods, including rote learning and lecture-based instruction, may be resistant to change, making it challenging to widely adopt the flipped classroom model.
3	Teacher Preparedness and Training	Western teachers frequently benefit from professional development opportunities, including training in digital tools and pedagogical strategies, to implement innovative teaching models like the flipped classroom.	India's teachers face significant barriers to implementing the flipped classroom model due to inadequate training in technology and active learning strategies, and limited professional development opportunities.
4	Curriculum Rigidity	Western curriculums are often flexible, allowing educators to experiment with new teaching methods like flipped classrooms, allowing teachers to adjust their methods to meet the needs of their students. Class-prep tasks were simplified to reward students' solo engagement with online content, while in-class activities were typically more challenging (Brown, 2018).	The Indian education system's rigid curriculum, heavily reliant on standardized testing and extensive syllabi, restricts teachers' ability to experiment with alternative teaching models like the flipped classroom, limiting their ability to tailor lessons for maximum benefits.
5	Resource Availability and Support	Western schools and universities have access to resources like online platforms, digital content, and technical support, making it easier to implement the flipped classroom model.	Indian schools face challenges in adopting the flipped classroom model due to resource constraints, lack of access to high-quality digital content, insufficient funding for technological tools, and limited administrative support.
6	Student and Parent Acceptance	Western students and parents generally accept non-traditional teaching methods, such as the flipped classroom model, which is seen as positively enhancing learning outcomes (Goodwin & Miller, 2013; Green, 2012).	In India, traditional teaching methods may lead to skepticism towards the flipped classroom model due to concerns about self-directed learning effectiveness and the unfamiliarity with digital resources.

Educational Outcomes Associated with the Flipped Classroom Model in Western Countries and India

Enhanced Understanding and Retention of Material

Studies in Western countries have shown that students in flipped classrooms often exhibit better understanding and retention of course material compared to traditional lecture-based instruction (González-Zamar & Abad-Segura, 2022; Lee & Lee, 2021). The opportunity to engage with content actively during class, coupled with self-paced learning at home, leads to deeper comprehension and longer-lasting knowledge.

In Indian settings where the flipped classroom model has been effectively implemented, students also report improved understanding and retention. However, the effectiveness is largely contingent on the quality of resources and the support provided to students for self-learning at home.

Improved Student Engagement

The flipped classroom model has generally led to higher levels of student engagement in Western countries. The active, collaborative nature of in-class activities fosters a more dynamic and interactive learning environment. Students tend to be more motivated and involved in their learning process. According to Haghighi *et al.* (2019) and Keskin (2023), there is the concern that flipped learning generally dependents on student participation

In India, when implemented effectively, the flipped

classroom model has shown potential for increasing student engagement, particularly in urban and private schools. However, in less resource-rich settings, the lack of access to quality digital content and the challenges of adjusting to new learning methods can dampen student enthusiasm and engagement.

Higher Academic Performance

Empirical evidence from Western countries suggests that the flipped classroom model can lead to improved academic performance, particularly in subjects that benefit from hands-on learning and problem-solving during class time. Students often perform better on assessments that require critical thinking and application of knowledge. The flipped methodology improved student perceptions about and attitudes regarding the class, both of which can be important in stimulating student learning (Cobb, 2015).

The impact on academic performance in India is more variable. In well-resourced schools, the flipped classroom model has been associated with better test scores and overall academic achievement. However, in settings with limited access to technology and support, the benefits are less pronounced, and traditional methods may still dominate in terms of measurable outcomes.

Development of Critical Thinking and Problem-Solving Skills

The flipped classroom model in Western countries has been effective in developing students' critical thinking and problem-solving skills. The model encourages students to engage with complex problems during class, where they can collaborate with peers and receive immediate feedback from instructors.

In India, the development of critical thinking skills through the flipped classroom model is still emerging. In schools that have adopted this approach, students have shown improvements in analytical and problem-solving abilities, particularly in STEM subjects. However, the lack of widespread implementation and the traditional emphasis on rote learning limit the broader development of these skills.

Increased Teacher-Student Interaction

The flipped classroom model in Western countries has led to more personalized and meaningful teacher-student interactions. Flipped instruction (FL) improves student test scores and motivation, benefiting students of all levels (Khanova *et al.*, 2015; Lin & Hwang, 2019). Teachers also experience greater job satisfaction and repeat the methodology in subsequent academic years. FL allows teachers to address individual student needs, provide targeted support, and facilitate deeper discussions, enhancing overall learning and teaching experiences (Kurihara, 2020; Tang *et al.*, 2020). This approach encourages deeper discussions and deeper learning (Zainuddin & Halili, 2016).

In India, the potential for increased teacher-student interaction exists, but its realization is uneven. In schools where the flipped classroom model is well-implemented, teachers can focus more on guiding students through complex concepts and addressing individual challenges. However, in resource-constrained settings, large class sizes and limited time may still impede the quality of interaction.

Varied Impact on Different Student Demographics

The flipped classroom model in Western countries tends to benefit a broad range of students, though some research indicates that students who are self-motivated and have strong time management skills gain the most. Support mechanisms are often in place to help students who may struggle with self-directed learning.

In India, the impact of the flipped classroom model varies significantly across different student demographics. Students in urban areas and those from higher socio-economic backgrounds, who have better access to technology and support at home, tend to benefit more. Conversely, students from rural or economically disadvantaged backgrounds may struggle with the self-learning component due to lack of resources and support.

Role of Technological Infrastructure in the Success of the Flipped Classroom Model in Western and Indian Contexts

Availability and Access to Technology

Advanced technological infrastructure, including high-speed internet, personal computers, tablets, and interactive learning platforms, is widely available in Western countries. This facilitates the effective implementation of the flipped classroom model, as students and teachers can easily access and use digital resources for learning and teaching.

Technological infrastructure is uneven across India. Urban areas and private institutions often have access to the necessary technology, while rural and government schools may face significant gaps. Limited access to high-speed internet and devices poses a major challenge for the widespread adoption of the flipped classroom model in less developed areas.

Quality of Digital Learning Resources

Western countries generally benefit from a rich ecosystem of high-quality digital learning resources, including educational videos, interactive tools, and online courses. These resources support the flipped classroom model by providing engaging and effective content for students to review outside of class.

The availability of high-quality digital resources is more limited in India. Although there are initiatives to create and distribute educational content, the quality and breadth of resources are not always consistent. This can affect the effectiveness of the flipped classroom model, particularly in areas with fewer resources.

Technical Support and Training

There is often robust technical support and training available for both teachers and students in Western countries. Schools and universities provide resources

and training to help users effectively navigate and utilize digital tools and platforms.

Technical support and training are less consistently available in India. While some schools and educational institutions are working to improve digital literacy and support, many teachers and students lack adequate training in using educational technologies, which can hinder the successful implementation of the flipped classroom model.

Internet Connectivity

Reliable and high-speed internet connectivity is a norm in Western countries, enabling seamless access to online learning materials and platforms. This supports the flipped classroom model by ensuring that students can watch lecture videos and complete assignments without technical interruptions.

Internet connectivity in India varies widely. While urban centers often have good connectivity, rural and remote areas may experience slow or unreliable internet access. This disparity affects the ability of students in less connected areas to fully engage with online content required for the flipped classroom model. The Indian government is digitizing higher education campuses to improve internet connectivity for all students. Initiatives to make web-based resources available for higher education began in the 1990s, with top institutions like IITs, UGC, NPTEL, and CEC contributing to this progress (Dangwal & Mishra, 2020).

Infrastructure for Digital Collaboration

Many Western countries have established infrastructure that supports digital collaboration, such as online discussion forums, collaborative tools, and virtual classrooms. This infrastructure enhances the flipped classroom model by allowing students to collaborate on projects and participate in discussions outside of class.

Infrastructure for digital collaboration is less developed in India. Although there are efforts to introduce collaborative tools, the lack of widespread access to these tools and platforms can limit the effectiveness of collaborative elements in the flipped classroom model.

Adaptability of Technology to Local Contexts

Technology in Western countries is often adaptable to diverse educational contexts and can be customized to meet the specific needs of different student populations and subject areas.

The adaptability of technology to local contexts in India can be challenging due to diverse educational needs and varying levels of technological infrastructure. Efforts to tailor technology to fit local conditions are ongoing but can be constrained by resource limitations and infrastructural gaps.

Readiness and Training of Teachers in Implementing the Flipped Classroom Approach in Western Countries Versus India

Flipped classroom course success relies heavily on

Table 2: Present the readiness and training of teachers in implementing the Flipped Classroom Approach in Western countries versus India

Sl. No.	Key Point	Western Countries	India
1	Availability of Professional Development	Western teachers have access to extensive professional development opportunities, including workshops, online courses, and educational conferences, focusing on innovative teaching methods like the flipped classroom model, to integrate new pedagogical approaches into their practice.	India's teachers face limited professional development opportunities, particularly in innovative methods like flipped classrooms, and many, especially in rural or government schools, lack comprehensive training in modern teaching techniques, despite some initiatives.
2	Support and Resources for Teachers	Western countries' institutions provide significant support to teachers, including access to educational technology, teaching resources, and administrative assistance, enabling them to effectively implement the flipped classroom model.	India's teachers face uneven support, with some urban and private schools providing resources and administrative support for new teaching methods, while many, especially in government or rural schools, lack institutional backing.
3	Technological Proficiency	Western teachers often possess advanced technological proficiency, enabling them to effectively utilize digital tools for creating and managing flipped classroom content.	India's teachers' technological proficiency varies, with urban and private schools having a higher level of familiarity with digital tools, while rural and under-resourced teachers may struggle due to limited training and experience.
4	Adaptation to New Teaching Models	Western teachers are more adaptable to new teaching models like the flipped classroom due to their culture of educational experimentation and innovation, which supports their ability to integrate and refine these models effectively.	India's traditional teaching methods and resistance to change may hinder the slow adaptation to new teaching models, necessitating additional support and time for teachers to integrate the flipped classroom model into their routines.

5	Student and Parent Support	In Western countries, students and parents generally support innovative teaching methods, contributing to the successful implementation of the flipped classroom model, as both groups are willing to adapt to new learning approaches.	The flipped classroom model in India faces inconsistent support from students and parents, with some in urban and private schools being open to it, while others, especially in areas with traditional educational expectations, may require more persuasion and evidence of effectiveness.
6	Institutional Culture and Policy	Western educational institutions promote innovation and continuous improvement, promoting new teaching models like flipped classrooms. Institutional policies encourage experimentation and provide necessary infrastructure and support.	India's conservative institutional culture, primarily centered on traditional teaching methods and exam-oriented education, presents challenges in implementing the flipped classroom model, necessitating significant policy changes and support to overcome resistance and promote innovation.

educator readiness, as lack of confidence or enthusiasm can hinder its effectiveness (Moffett, 2015; Shimamoto, 2012; Snowden, 2012; Phillips & Wiesbaue, 2022).

RECOMMENDATIONS

Some recommendations have been highlighted for enhancing the adoption and effectiveness of the Flipped Classroom Model in India based on practices observed in Western Countries.

Invest in Technological Infrastructure

The study suggests that investing in advanced technological infrastructure in Indian schools, especially in rural and underserved areas, could significantly improve the adoption and effectiveness of the flipped classroom model, highlighting the need for reliable internet access and necessary devices.

Enhance Professional Development

The recommendation is to introduce comprehensive professional development programs for Indian teachers, focusing on digital literacy and innovative teaching methods, such as the flipped classroom approach, to enhance their ability to effectively implement and sustain this model.

Adapt the Curriculum

The Indian curriculum should be adapted to accommodate the flipped classroom model, focusing on active learning and student-centered approaches, to enhance its effectiveness and integration with Western countries' more flexible curricula.

Increase Access to Quality Digital Resources

The proposal suggests creating and distributing high-quality digital learning resources and educational content tailored to Indian students and teachers, akin to the resources found in Western countries, to enhance content delivery and engagement.

Foster a Supportive Institutional Culture

Establish a culture in India that promotes experimentation with new teaching methods, such as the flipped classroom, and provides administrative and peer support for teachers, akin to Western countries' innovation culture, to facilitate the successful adoption of this model.

Engage Students and Parents

Increase awareness and communication about the benefits and goals of the flipped classroom model in India to build support and understanding among students and parents, as this approach is generally supported in Western countries.

Develop Local Adaptations and Support Structures

The success of the flipped classroom model in Western countries underscores the need for local adaptations and support structures, particularly in India, to improve its effectiveness and sustainability, as the model's success in Western countries underscores the importance of tailoring approaches.

CONCLUSION

The flipped classroom model, which involves students using lecture materials at home and using classroom time for active learning, offers both opportunities and challenges in different educational contexts. This comparative study between Western countries and India highlights the diverse experiences and outcomes of implementing this model, highlighting factors contributing to its success and barriers to overcome.

The flipped classroom model, popular in Western countries, is facilitated by technological infrastructure, flexible curricula, and a culture of educational innovation. However, its adoption in India is uneven, with rural and government schools facing significant challenges. The digital divide in India is a significant barrier, as many students lack reliable internet and devices, making it difficult to engage with online content. Cultural and educational norms also play a role in the successful implementation of the flipped classroom model. Teacher preparedness and training are crucial for the successful implementation, as in India, professional development

opportunities are less widespread and many teachers lack training in using digital tools and active learning strategies. Addressing the technological gap in India is essential for the broader adoption of the flipped classroom model, with investments in improving internet connectivity, providing devices, and ensuring access to high-quality digital resources.

The flipped classroom model has the potential to improve educational outcomes by increasing engagement and active learning. However, India faces unique challenges that require targeted solutions. To maximize the benefits of the model, India must invest in technology, professional development, curriculum adaptation, and community engagement. By learning from successful Western practices and adapting them to local needs, India can enhance its educational practices and improve learning outcomes for students across diverse settings.

REFERENCES

Baptist, C., & Befani, B. (2015). *Qualitative comparative analysis: A rigorous qualitative method for assessing impact.* Coffey. http://www.coffey.com/assets/Ingenuity/Qualitative-Comparative-Analysis-June2015.pdf

Bergmann, J., & Sams, A. (2012). *Flip your classroom: Reach every student in every class every day.* International Society for Technology in Education.

Bolbakov, R. G., Sinitsyn, A. V., & Tsvetkov, V. Y. (2020). Methods of comparative analysis. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 1679,* 052047. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1679/5/052047

Boyraz, S., & Ocak, G. (2017). Implementation of flipped education into the Turkish EFL teaching context. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies, 13*(2), 426–439.

Brewer, R., & Movahedazarhouligh, S. (2018). Successful stories and conflicts: A literature review on the effectiveness of flipped learning in higher education. *Journal of Computer Assisted Learning, 34,* 409–416. https://doi.org/10.1111/jcal.12250

Brown, A. F. (2018). Implementing the flipped classroom: Challenges and strategies. In J. Mehring & A. Leis (Eds.), *Innovations in flipping the language classroom* (pp. 21–36). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-6968-0_2

Çakır, R., Sayın, V., & Bektaş, S. (2021). Bibliometric analysis of studies conducted between 2015-2019 on the flipped classroom model. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science, 7*(1), 163-187. https://doi.org/10.46328/ijres.1126

Cetin Koroglu, Z., & Cakir, A. (2017). Implementation of flipped instruction in language classrooms: An alternative way to develop speaking skills of pre-service English language teachers. *International Journal of Education and Development Using Information and Communication Technology, 13*(2), 42–55.

Cobb, W. N. W. (2015). Turning the classroom upside down: Experimenting with the flipped classroom in American government. *Journal of Political Science Education, 12*(1), 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1080/15512169.2015.1063437

Dangwal, K. L., & Mishra, D. (2020). Educational web portals of higher education and their problems. *Universal Journal of Educational Research, 8*(2), 387–392. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.080207

Dong, Y., Tin, H., Du, S., & Wang, A. (2021). The effects of flipped classroom characterized by situational and collaborative learning in a community nursing course: A quasi-experimental design. *Nurse Education Today, 105,* 105037. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nedt.2021.105037

Drobnič, S. (2014). Comparative analysis. In A. C. Michalos (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of quality of life and well-being research* (pp. 1099–1102). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-0753-5_492

Ekmekci, E. (2017). The flipped writing classroom in the Turkish EFL context: A comparative study on a new model. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education, 18*(2), 151–167.

González-Zamar, M.-D., & Abad-Segura, E. (2022). Global evidence on flipped learning in higher education. *Education Sciences, 12*(8), 515. https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci12080515

Goodwin, B., & Miller, K. (2013). Research says evidence on flipped classrooms is still coming. *Educational Leadership, 70*(6), 78–80.

Green, G. (2012). The flipped classroom and school approach: Clintondale High School [Paper presentation]. In *Annual Building Learning Communities Education Conference.* Boston, MA, United States.

Habib, A., & Morse, T. E. (2022). An examination of the flipped classroom paradigm for diverse student populations. In O. Noroozi & I. Sahin (Eds.), *Proceedings of IHSES 2022 International Conference on Humanities, Social and Education Sciences* (pp. 1–17). ISTES Organization.

Haghighi, H., Jafarigohar, M., Khoshsima, H., & Vahdany, F. (2019). Impact of flipped classroom on EFL learners' appropriate use of refusal: Achievement, participation, perception. *Computer Assisted Language Learning, 32*(3), 261–293. https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2018.1504083

Huang, Y. N., & Hong, Z. R. (2016). The effects of a flipped English classroom intervention on students' information and communication technology and English reading comprehension. *Educational Technology Research and Development, 64*(2), 175–193.

Kahu, E. R. (2013). Framing student engagement in higher education. *Studies in Higher Education, 38*(5), 758–773. https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2011.598505

Keskin, D. (2023). Implementation of flipped model in EFL reading classrooms. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education, 24*(3), 261–276.

Khanova, J., Roth, M. T., Rodgers, J. E., & McLaughlin, J. E. (2015). Student experiences across multiple flipped courses in a single curriculum. *Medical Education, 49,*

1038–1048. https://doi.org/10.1111/medu.12807

Kong, S. C., & Song, Y. (2015). An experience of personalized learning hub initiative embedding BYOD for reflective engagement in higher education. *Computer & Education, 88,* 227–240. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2015.06.003

Kurihara, Y. (2020). How should higher education institutions provide lectures under the COVID-19 crisis? *Education, Society and Human Studies, 1,* 144–153. https://doi.org/10.22158/eshs.v1n2p144

Lai, C.-L., & Hwang, G.-J. (2016). A self-regulated flipped classroom approach to improving students' learning performance in a mathematics course. *Computer & Education, 100,* 126–140. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2016.05.006

Lee, H., & Lee, Y. (2021). Analysis of learning outcomes and learners' experiences on flipped learning applied to 'Introduction to Special Education' course. *Korean Journal of Physical Medicine and Multidisciplinary Health Disability, 64,* 241–269. https://doi.org/10.20971/kcpmd.2021.64.2.241

Lewis, C. E., Chen, D. C., & Relan, A. (2018). Implementation of a flipped classroom approach to promote active learning in the third-year surgery clerkship. *The American Journal of Surgery, 215*(2), 298–303. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amjsurg.2017.08.050

Lin, H.-C., & Hwang, G.-J. (2019). Research trends of flipped classroom studies for medical courses: A review of journal publications from 2008 to 2017 based on the technology-enhanced learning model. *Interactive Learning Environment, 27,* 1011–1027. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2018.1467462

Li, S., Fu, W., Liu, X., & Hwang, G.-J. (2024). Effectiveness of flipped classrooms for K–12 students: Evidence from a three-level meta-analysis. *Review of Educational Research.* https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543241261732

Martynyuk, O. (2019). American flipped classroom model in teaching linguistic disciplines to students majoring in a foreign language. *Comparative Professional Pedagogy, 9*(3), 22–28. http://dx.doi.org/10.2478/rpp-2019-0025

Moffett, J. (2015). Twelve tips for "flipping" the classroom. *Medical Teacher, 37*(4), 331–336. https://doi.org/10.3109/0142159X.2014.943710

Nouri, J. (2016). The flipped classroom: For active, effective, and increased learning—especially for low achievers. *International Journal of Educational Technology in Higher Education, 13,* 33. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41239-016-0032-z

Papadakis, S., Gariou-Papalexiou, A., & Makrodimos, N. (2019). How to design and implement a flipped classroom lesson: A bottom-up procedure for more effective lessons. *Open Journal for Educational Research, 3*(2), 53–66. https://doi.org/10.32591/coas.ojer.0302.02053p

Phillips, J., & Wiesbauer, F. (2022). The flipped classroom in medical education: A new standard in teaching. *Trends in Anaesthesia and Critical Care, 42,* 4–8. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tacc.2022.01.001

Plešec Gasparič, R., Valenčič Zuljan, M., & Kalin, J. (2020). Flipped learning and teaching as an opportunity for innovative and flexible implementation of student groupings in higher education. *Journal of Elementary Education, 13,* 51–80. https://doi.org/10.18690/rei.13.Spec.Iss.51-80.2020

Ragin, C. (1984). *What is qualitative comparative analysis* (QCA)? http://eprints.ncrm.ac.uk/250/1/What_is_QCA.pdf

Saira, F. A., & Hafeez, M. (2021). Critical review on flipped classroom model versus traditional lecture method. *International Journal of Education and Practice, 9*(1), 128–140. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1295493.pdf

Schatz, F., & Welle, K. (2016). Qualitative comparative analysis: A valuable approach to add to the evaluator's toolbox? Lessons from recent applications. CDI Practice Paper No. 13.

Shimamoto, D. N. (2012). Implementing a flipped classroom: An instructional module. *Paper presentation at the Technology, Colleges, and Community Worldwide Online Conference,* 17 April 2012.

Snowden, K. E. (2012). *Teachers' perceptions of the flipped classroom: Using video lectures online to replace traditional in-class lectures* (Master's thesis, University of North Texas).

Srinivasan, S., & Kumar, H. (2020). Flipped classroom model: A possibility in the Indian higher education system. *Journal of Critical Reviews, 7*(15), 1486–1490. https://www.jcreview.com/admin/Uploads/Files/61db60a97cce75.56589604.pdf

Tang, Y., Hew, K. F., & Lo, C. K. (2020). Investigating the use of mobile instant messaging-facilitated 5E-flipped learning: A two-stage study. *International Journal of Innovation and Learning, 27,* 287–309. https://www.inderscience.com/jhome.php?jcode=ijil

Tsvetkov, V. Y. (2014). Worldview model as the result of education. *World Applied Sciences Journal, 31*(2), 211–215.

Uzunboylu, H., & Karagozlu, D. (2015). Flipped classroom: A review of recent literature. *World Journal on Educational Technology, 7*(2), 142–147. https://doi.org/10.18844/wjet.v7i2.46

Wang, K., & Zhu, C. (2019). MOOC-based flipped learning in higher education: Students' participation, experience, and learning performance. *International Journal of Educational Technologies in Higher Education, 16,* 33. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41239-019-0163-0

Youhasan, P., Chen, Y., Lyndon, M. P., & Henning, M. A. (2022). University teachers' perceptions of readiness for flipped classroom pedagogy in undergraduate nursing education: A qualitative study. *Journal of Professional Nursing, 41,* 36–43. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.profnurs.2022.04.001

Yu, Z., & Wang, G. (2016). Academic achievements and satisfaction of the clicker-aided flipped business

English writing class. *Educational Technology & Society, 19*(2), 298–310.

Zainuddin, Z., & Halili, S. H. (2016). Flipped classroom research and trends from different fields of study. *The International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning, 17*(3), 313–340. https://doi.org/10.19173/irrodl.v17i3.2274