The Influence of Teacher Incentives on Student Academic Achievement in Public Secondary Schools
Abdulsatar Muktar Abubakar*
absent from their classrooms even more frequently. Work in progress of studies done in different areas suggests that absence rates among primary-school teachers are 26% in Uganda, 23% in India, 16% in Ecuador and 13% in Peru. Moreover, in settings with low motivation, it could be argued that the key problem is to get teachers to show up at all. Set that most teaching and learning in many developing and under developed countries is by rote, the risk of reducing efforts to inspire creativity may seem remote (Glewwe et al., 2003).

In public secondary schools, being a schoolteacher is one of the lowest paid job in the country; two hundred US dollars are the most paid checks entire the country. The working hours are so many; six days with seven lectures per day. Schoolteachers in Somalia have no rewards, health and social insurance like other jobs in the country; the absence of a central government and strong local authorities in Somalia has caused and stimulated the inhuman practices of education privatization. Somali school founders behave like traditional business owners charging high tuition fee for students and less payment for schoolteachers, which in turn result poor academic achievement of the students (Ali et al., 2016).

Teacher incentives and job satisfaction of the teachers are very vital to improve system of education in Somalia and around the world. Teacher incentives plays an essential role in the organization because it increases the productivity and goals can be achieved an efficient way and incentives encourage teachers because it helps to achieve target goals in efficiency way. Teacher motivation is very important since it enhances the skills and knowledge of teachers seeing as it directly influences the student's attainment (Othman, 2010).

**Teacher Monetary Incentive and Academic Achievement**

Money is believed to be the solution to most problems in the current century (21st), since it (money) can buy almost everything - depending on the amount. For the average human being, money is used to buy basic human needs such as a house, food, clothes, and medicine, among other basic necessities. In the contemporary set up, firms provide monetary incentives in two ways: direct monetary incentives and indirect monetary incentives. Two of the most known monetary compensations are salary and commissions. Indirect monetary compensations (at times referred to as employee benefits) may include education reimbursement, childcare compensation, insurance schemes, and paid leave (AIFUOR, 2022).

Monetary incentives provide the flexibility for the recipients to spend the money in whichever way they (employees) want it, and it is mostly useful when they (employees) expect the same kind of reward the next year (or period) should they exert similar effort in their work. However, documented literature focusing on the influence of monetary incentives on students' academic achievement seems to reveal inconsistent findings (AIFUOR, 2022). Researchers has been demonstrated constantly the teacher’s contribution to student educational achievement. Thus, school administrations have increasingly employed programs based on teacher incentive pay and developed as a means for improving student performance. They provide monetary incentives as motivation program for teachers to increase effort and to try new strategies that lead to higher measured achievement (Brehm et al., 2017).

The main findings in the relevant body of literature we reviewed is that the most likely promising way to improve student's achievements is to institute monetary incentives based on performance, giving direct rewards for developments in student achievements. There is a claim that alternative interventions, when used in the past, have a tendency to raise expenses without improving student performance in proportion. Nonetheless, there is a dearth of experience when it comes to using performance rewards in schools. As a result, several authors stress that much more hard data regarding the ideal incentive structure in schools, as well as its impact and cost, is required before instituting school incentives as the next educational revolution (Lavy, 2002).

**Tangible Non-Monetary Incentives for Teachers and Student Academic Achievement**

Tangible Non-monetary incentives comprise trophies, certificates, candies, or toys for example. Non-monetary incentives in the category granting rights and privileges are mostly non-tangible (although they might be given in the form of a voucher) and grant students privileges such as getting out of one homework assignment or having the privilege to go off campus during the school day. Incentives such as bonus points for the next exam also fall into this category, as they can be interpreted as a privilege to start the exam with a lead compared to others (Schildberg-hörisch et al., 2018).

Non-monetary incentives are used to motivate teachers and boost performance has gained immense momentum in recent times. Tangible non-monetary incentives are as important as monetary incentives, and when carefully designed and implemented, these incentives pegged on performance can be very effective in boosting academic achievement and productivity (AIFUOR, 2022).

The study shows that monetary incentives, specifically tangible non-monetary motivations have substantial impact on teacher's motivation. Research indicated that tangible non-monetary motivations are the only factors having no substantial impact on teacher's motivation. In addition, the result designates that intangible non-monetary motivations are the most influential factors affecting employees’ motivation in PT XYZ's Finance function. Critical to note from this study is that it focused on employees in a distribution firm, yet little attention has been paid to how tangible non-monetary incentives motivate teachers in secondary schools (Ngasi et al., 2020).
Intangible Non-monetary Incentives for Teachers and Academic Achievement

Incentives that fall into this category are either social related or job related. Social related incentives are recognitions that employers make toward employees, basically referred to as employee recognition. Employee recognition is a channel through which employers express gratitude toward employees for their (employees) good work attitude, effort, contribution, or outstanding performance (Lai, 2009). Motivating employees through recognition involves no cost to the organization, and is sometimes offered alongside tangible incentives. Fisher (2007) averts that many employees quit their jobs because their (employers) do not recognize their exemplary performance. Social rewards serve to satisfy the needs for affiliation, esteem, and self-actualization (in the Maslow’s hierarchy of need ladder) (AWTUOR, 2022).

Non-monetary reward systems include intangible rewards that offer compensation to the teachers for their performance in realizing high achievements of their students. Non-monetary rewards are intangible in nature and offer psychological satisfaction to the teacher. According to Armstrong (2007) signs of gratitude, appreciation and thankfulness to the teacher offer some form of nonmonetary reward to the teacher. Non-monetary rewards boost the psychological motivation of teachers as well as promote teacher commitment, which is a major critique of the monetary forms of reward (Journal et al., 2019).

Intangible non-monetary incentives including recognition and praise have proved effective in teachers’ motivation. Study asserts that the success and powerful existence of an organization is determined through the satisfaction of its teachers. Furthermore, awarding teachers with incentives seems to impact on teachers’ retention. Teachers who are given non-monetary incentives are more satisfied and continued teaching in schools, while those who did not get remained not fulfilled and resigned the teaching career (Journal et al., 2019).

Statement of Problem

Good academic achievement of students in any school is only achievable through effective incentives given for teachers (Hanushek et al., 2005). In order to enhance students’ academic achievement, teachers should enjoy all the incentives that take part to motivate teachers. Teachers can get these incentives through monetary, which occur, in two ways: direct monetary incentives and indirect monetary incentives. Two of the most known monetary compensations are salary and commissions. Indirect monetary compensations may include insurance scheme and paid leave. Teachers also acquire tangible non-monetary incentives, which include awards and certificates given to the teachers based on their performance. Lasty, they obtain intangible non-monetary rewards such as praise and recognition. However, being a schoolteacher in public secondary schools is one of the lowest standard working conditions. It is the lowest paid job in many poor countries; the working hours are so many; six days with 7 lectures per day. Schoolteachers in public secondary schools have no both tangible monetary incentives such as awards and certificates of appreciation; even they do not have intangible monetary incentives such a praise and recognition. The success of students in their academic achievement is associated in the rewards and incentives have their teachers. Therefore, the study will investigate the effect of teacher incentives on student’s achievement in public secondary schools.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to establish the influence of teacher incentives on students’ academic achievement in public secondary schools.

Specifically this Study Aims to

1. Assess the influence of monetary incentives for teachers on student academic achievement in public secondary schools.
2. Establish the influence of tangible non-monetary incentives for teachers on student academic achievement in public secondary schools.
3. Investigate the influence of intangible non-monetary incentives for teachers on student academic achievement in public secondary schools.

Significance of the Study

Following highlighted bellow was the significance of the study

- This study will be beneficial to the policy making agencies including ministers, and other administrators of public secondary schools who desire good academic achievements, because they would obtain appropriate tips how to motivate the teaching staff in their endeavors to make students success in their academic achievement.
- The parents who are always called upon to pay for remedial lessons necessary for offering financial incentives will benefit from the study because this work would provide insight information on why students from other institutions perform better due to school based incentives.
- This research is intended to benefit teachers who are the main consumers of school-based incentives, by emphasizing to them the desires and objective of the learning institutions, which necessitates the introduction of such incentives.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

Teacher Incentives

Schools both Public and private have employed teacher incentive remuneration programs more frequently as a means of raising student performance. Teachers incentives based on their performance are important to school administration, indicating that these kinds of programs will probably play a big part in education policy

https://journals.e-palli.com/home/index.php/ajahs
Rewards are important as research on the use of teacher performance incentives that have been identified and studied. Moreover, transportation, are examples of indirect monetary resources provided for supervision and personal education are attempting to promote. Other financial labor. Allowances are monetary incentives that are linked in incentives because they are received in exchange for their teachers' pay and benefits are considered direct monetary across all high school grades. (Lavy, 2015). Furthermore, study suggests P4P plans for teacher compensation are frequently criticized for failing to account for performance. In other industries, incentive pay boosts employee output and effort by bringing employers and employees' interests into line, revealing the most important aspects of a worker's job, and inspiring employees to put in extra effort (Crystallography, 2016b).

Teacher Monetary Incentive and Students Academic Achievement
Incentives for bettering student performance through money are increasingly being used in many nations' educational systems. The findings indicate that incentives are a useful strategy for raising enrollment and attendance, particularly in developing nations. Whereas the findings are ambiguous with regard to the impact on students' effort and achievement (de Paola et al., 2012).

In addition, the monetary incentives for teachers are determined by the academic performance of students in their senior year of high school as well as the dropout rate across all high school grades. (Lavy, 2015). Furthermore, Teachers' pay and benefits are considered direct monetary incentives because they are received in exchange for their labor. Allowances are monetary incentives that are linked to the particular behavior that system stakeholders in education are attempting to promote. Other financial resources provided for supervision and personal support, such as free or subsidized housing, food, and transportation, are examples of indirect monetary incentives that have been identified and studied. Moreover, research on the use of teacher performance incentives to boost secondary school teachers' productivity found a strong correlation between the two. These relationships were found to be related to teachers' performance and increased effort as well as student learning outcomes, classroom behavior, attendance, and teaching methods. (Ibiwumi & Chinedu, 2021).

Multiple monetary incentives are ineffective, and this can be linked to factors that make teaching in schools particularly difficult. This is a compelling but challenging argument for rewarding better teaching because of the complexity of the teaching profession, its relationship to student outcomes, and the substantial influence that student outcomes have on students' prospects for the future. After that, monetary rewards like grants are connected to these evaluations. Tenure, bonus, raise, or promotion for teachers. Financial teacher incentive programs connected to teacher assessments had no impact on student achievement in Tennessee or New York City.

Teachers receive a bonus payment in cash that is determined to be valuable, meaning that the expected return on their effort exceeds any associated costs. For instance, the average salary in the nation is $10,000, which is what teachers in country x receive in public schools. Teachers consider a $1000 pay increase to be valuable enough to put in the extra effort required to raise students' test scores by an average of five points (Mallah, 2018).

Tangible Non-Monetary Incentives and Students' Academic Achievement
The motivation of employees is significantly impacted by tangible non-monetary incentives. Only non-monetary, tangible rewards are not significantly affecting the motivation of employees. The degree of motivation that comes from teaching responsibilities determines how effective a teacher is. While the government offers a universal teacher reward program, individual school-based incentives may be the only explanation for why some teachers work harder and produce higher-quality work (Ngasi et al., 2020). Rewards are important as monetary incentives, and when carefully designed and implemented, these incentives pegged on performance can be very effective in boosting academic achievement and productivity. The use of non-monetary rewards to motivate teachers and boost performance has gained immense momentum in recent times (MUSA, 2022).

One could contend that incentives of non-monetary as a means for motivation take into account both extrinsic and intrinsic motivation theories. Non-monetary incentives, with their diversity, can motivate employees both intrinsically and extrinsically, whereas monetary incentives can only be categorized as a factor leading to extrinsic motivation. For example, tangible nonmonetary incentives such as small gifts, free food or drink, internet access, tickets to movie/theatre/sports facilities etc. or social non-monetary incentives such as company picnics, after-work parties, friendly greetings by the supervisor, recognition of a good job, feedback about performance.

https://journals.e-palli.com/home/index.php/ajahs
etc. may have extrinsic motivational powers (Basu, 2004). When used as a teaching strategy, rewards can take on a wide range of material and intangible forms. Children can find the following physical forms in the form of objects that are both entertaining and instructive: The teacher grinned widely, indicating her approval of the student’s response. Indri Sari’s research indicates that the kind of reward given to students can be represented by numbers. The numbers given indicate the points or grades received by the students for taking part in the learning activity (Hussain et al., 2023).

Intangible Non-Monetary Incentives and Student’s Academic Achievement

According to (Al-Four, 2022) Intangible incentives: are rewards, which are not in the form of direct cash or material like appointment to positions, praises and certain other privileges. Their study also indicated Incentives that fall under this category are either social related or job related. Social related incentives are recognitions that employers make toward employees, which referred to as employee recognition. Employers express gratitude and appreciation toward their employees through employee recognition as a channel for their good work attitude, effort, or contribution to the results or the outcome achieved. As (Tolero et al., 2021) suggests, tangible and intangible incentives by giving praise and giving food treatment to the students relate to enhancing student’s academic achievement.

A reward is something given to teachers to teach students well. If the teacher works hard, he will contribute to enhance student’s academic achievement. In general, an incentive is somewhat that is given or accepted in appreciation of someone’s actions, accomplishments, or efforts. It could be something material like cash, presents, or awards, or it could be something intangible like approval, praise, or a feeling of achievement. Rewards establish a positive association between the action and the result, which is why they are frequently used to encourage people to carry out specific tasks or behaviors (Bloom & Reenen, 2013).

Teachers’ motivation in the Finance function is primarily influenced by non-monetary, intangible incentives. It is important to highlight from this study that although it concentrated on teachers in the teaching and learning processes, there hasn’t been much discussion of how secondary school teachers are motivated by non-tangible, non-monetary incentives, which in turn contribute to increase student’s academic performance (Ngasi et al., 2020).

Since non-monetary rewards like awards or vacations foster a detachable bond, they are valued more highly than cash bonuses alone. In terms of inspiring educators, intangible non-monetary rewards like public recognition and praise have been shown to be effective. Teachers who receive these kinds of rewards report higher student performance than those who do not (Kassim & Onyango, 2022).

Students Academic Achievement

The students’ achievement in academics is the dependent variable, which focuses on outputs in relation with the inputs into the education system, with outputs being looked at under the lenses of academic achievements in examinations. This output is dependent upon aforementioned inputs (independent variables) like monetary, tangible non-monetary, and intangible non-monetary incentives. However, for optimum output (good teacher performance) to be achieved, adequate process (intervening variables) has to be effectively put in place. These are official education policies, administrative support, entry behavior of students, and the attitude of teachers towards students (Awoor, 2022).

It is a fact that society expects students to succeed academically, which is one of the most fundamental and important goals of educational institutions. Hence, academic achievement is taken into account along with a variety of competencies when educational systems set their goals and objectives. Achieving one’s goals is the definition of achievement (Ozcan, 2021).

Stated differently, achievement can be referred as the process of moving closer to the objectives set by organizations or individuals. For a student, accomplishment is completing the curriculum’s stated goals (Kazazoğlu, 2013).

However, the goal of this achievement in education is to advance academically. The accomplishment, development, and knowledge that teachers instill in their students in the classroom is known as academic achievement. All curriculum domains where a student’s behavior changes are considered indicators of academic achievement except of the psychomotor and affective domains. Students are expected to successfully complete assigned tasks, exhibit a perfectionist approach, show resistance in the face of difficulties, and develop strategies for overcoming obstacles in order to facilitate academic achievement (Ozcan, 2021).

METHODOLOGY

The study revised past literatures related to this research topic and obtained all information necessary to the research. The researcher collected findings and results obtained by the former authors, related to the main purpose and objectives of the study.

Based on the findings of the studies reviewed, this study collected a number of papers relevant to the subject of the study. The literature collected using google scholar database. The researcher first gathered forty articles, then used the remaining fifteen after excluding 25 articles based on relevance. From fifteen articles that were pertinent to the study’s topic, the researcher-identified themes from them, developed codes, and merged those codes to obtain frequency and percentage of the findings of this study.

Analysis

Objective One

Assess the influence of monetary incentives for teachers on student academic achievement in public secondary schools.
Based on the reviewed articles, all the authors agreed that monetary incentives plays a vital role in the achievement of students. 60% of the Authors expressed their result as monetary incentives motivate teachers, which in turn improves student achievement. Similarly, 40% of the articles reviewed expressed their results, as monetary incentives are positively correlate with student achievement. Overall, 100% of literature indicated that monetary incentives improves student achievement.

Table 1: Monetary incentives and Student academic achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Author of the paper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Monetary incentives motivate the teachers to put more effort for improved academic achievement”.</td>
<td>(AI FUOR, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Financial incentives increase enrollment, also results effort provision and achievement”.</td>
<td>(Schildberg-hörisch et al., 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“There is correlation among the relationships among awarding incentive pay, teacher motivation, and student achievement”.</td>
<td>(Mckinney et al., 2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Student achievement improves significantly when teachers are offered financial incentives that reward this.”</td>
<td>(Hanushek et al., 2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Monetary incentives have a positive effect on maintaining academic achievement among the students”.</td>
<td>(Journal et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Monetary incentives and Student academic achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Monetary incentives improve student achievement</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is correlation between the two</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the reviewed articles, 20% of the Authors indicated that tangible non-monetary incentives influence student achievement at low level. However, 80% found that Tangible non-monetary incentives improves student achievement.

Table 3: Tangible non-monetary incentives and Student academic achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Author of the paper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Tangible non-monetary incentives to teachers have influenced students’ academic performance to a low extent”.</td>
<td>(Ngasi et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Reward affect positively in classroom performance”</td>
<td>(Hussain et al., 2023)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Non-monetary incentives as motivating teachers to a large extent enhancing student academic achievement”.</td>
<td>(AI FUOR, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Tangible non-monetary incentives on pupils’ test scores”.</td>
<td>(Riener &amp; Wagner, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Non-monetary incentives contributed relatively to teacher educators’ job performance”</td>
<td>(Ibiwumi &amp; Chinedu, 2021)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4: Tangible non-monetary incentives and Student academic achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tangible non-monetary influence student achievement at low level</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tangible non-monetary incentives improves student achievement</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: Tangible non-monetary incentives and Student academic achievement

Objective Three

Investigate the influence of intangible non-monetary incentives for teachers on student academic achievement in public secondary schools.

Based on the reviewed articles, 67% of the Authors found that intangible non-monetary incentives improve student achievement. However, 33% of the literature reviewed found that there is correlation between intangible non-monetary incentives and student achievement.

Table 5: Intangible non-monetary incentives and Student academic achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Author of the paper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“There is no significant relationship between schools based intangible non-monetary incentives for teachers and student academic achievement”.</td>
<td>(AWUOR, 2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Intangible non-monetary incentives are the most influential factors affecting employees’ motivation”.</td>
<td>(Ngasi et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Intangible non-monetary initiatives provided are vital in school performance”.</td>
<td>(Kassim &amp; Onyango, 2022)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6: Intangible non-monetary incentives and Student achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intangible non-monetary incentives improves student achievement</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no correlation between intangible non-monetary incentives and student achievement</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3: Intangible non-monetary incentives and Student academic achievement

https://journals.e-palli.com/home/index.php/ajahs
DISCUSSION

The study focused on the effectiveness of teacher incentives on student academic achievement in public secondary schools (AWUOR, 2022). Regarding monetary incentives, significantly motivate the teachers to put more effort for improved academic achievement. In addition, the study summarizes the scientific evidence on the importance of financial incentives. Financial incentives work well in increasing attendance and enrollment. Financial incentives have mixed results regarding effort provision and achievement. Financial incentives seem to work for some students, but not for others (Schildberg-hörirsch et al., 2018). Furthermore, there are connections between student accomplishment, teacher motivation, and the distribution of incentive pay (McKinney et al., 2000). Moreover, Student achievement improves significantly when teachers are offered financial incentives that reward this (Hanushek et al., 2005).

According to the study, career pay for teachers does not increase student achievement and does not make teachers more intrinsically or extrinsically motivated than teachers who do not receive it. Financial rewards have a favorable impact on students’ continued academic success (Journal et al., 2019). Tangible non-monetary incentives like rewards affect positively in classroom performance, which in turn improves student achievement (Hussain et al., 2023). Similarly, non-monetary incentives as motivating teachers largely enhancing student academic achievement (AWUOR, 2022). Furthermore, tangible non-monetary incentives effect on pupils’ test scores (Riener & Wagner, 2019). Moreover, non-monetary incentives contributed relatively to teacher educators’ job performance (Ibiwumi & Chinedu, 2021). However, tangible non-monetary incentives to teachers have influenced students’ academic performance to a low extent (Ngasi et al., 2020).

Intangible non-monetary incentives are the most influential factors affecting employees’ motivation (Ngasi et al., 2020), additionally, initiatives provided are vital in school performance (Kassim & Onyango, 2022), conversely, according to (AWUOR, 2022) There is no significant relationship between schools based intangible non-monetary incentives for teachers and student academic achievement.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings of the study, the following conclusions were made:

The academic achievement of students and the financial incentives provided to teachers are positively correlated. A large material, non-monetary rewards are offered in schools to encourage teachers. Based on the findings of the final objective of the study, it can be concluded that intangible non-monetary incentives offered to teachers have no influence on students’ academic achievement. There is statistically insignificant positive correlation between school based intangible non-monetary incentives for teachers and students’ academic achievement.

RECOMMENDATIONS

From the study findings, the following recommendations were made:

• From the first objective, the study recommends to enhance monetary incentives of the schoolteachers and management so as to achieve the desired improvement in students’ academic achievement. However, the teachers are required get involved in the design and implementation of these incentives.

• From objective two of the study, it is recommended that school management expand tangible non-monetary rewards to include those that would improve work efficiency like laptop, printers and other gargets for ICT to enhance students’ academic achievement in public secondary schools.

• From the final objective, the study recommended that the scope of intangible non-monetary incentives should be expanded so as to satisfy diverse needs of the teachers and reduce teacher turnover in schools.

REFERENCES


Ozcan, M. (2021). Factors Affecting Students’ Academic Achievement according to the Teachers’ Opinion. Education Reform Journal, 6(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.22596/erj2021.06.01.18


